Book Reviews / Eighteenth-Nineteenth Centuries

Moreover, those attuned to the historiography on Mexican intellectual history will find an unresolved tension between a *criollista* reading of the period that reflects something akin to a long-standing party line at the Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México and El Colegio de México, and the consensus of the last few decades that the *criollista* framing has an exceedingly limited value for understanding the period's thought because it reflects rather the long shadow of German existentialism in postwar Mexican scholars' search for *lo mexicano*. As one reads, the book seems to oscillate between these two positions, at once emphasizing the criollo nature of Spanish American scholars (despite this not being the favored actor's category) and at others setting it aside and instead foregrounding the multiple identities of the scholars analyzed. This perhaps reflects the process of revising the manuscript. At the same time, the insights of some of the most innovative recent work, such as Peter Villella's *Indigenous Elites and Creole Identity in Colonial Mexico*, 1500–1800 (2016) and Gabriela Ramos and Yanna Yannakakis's *Indigenous Intellectuals: Knowledge*, *Power*, and Colonial Culture in Mexico and the Andes (2014), are conspicuous by their absence, mirroring again the criollo-centrism of older Mexican historiography that had little space in its nation-building project for non-Spanish intellectuals. Had the book taken an expansive view of Novohispanic society, a more fine-grain depiction of the Republic of Letters in the region would have emerged; it would also have rendered unnecessary the large sections of the book devoted to dismantling derivative Anglophone criollista scholarship, like Antony Higgins's *Constructing the* Criollo Archive: *Subjects of Knowledge in the "Bibliotheca Mexicana" and the "Rusticatio Mexicana"* (2000) (pp. 79–87).

Overall, this is an impressive work of synthesis and literary analysis that does a good job of applying some of the insights of cultural historians of Europe to Mexico, thereby seamlessly integrating New Spain into a polycentric vision of the Enlightenment Republic of Letters. By offering close readings of texts in their social, literary, and philosophical contexts, it usefully supplements, rather than replaces, the work of David Brading, Jorge Cañizares-Esguerra, and Andrew Laird and provides an invitation to explore more deeply the multiethnic world of eighteenth-century Mexican scholarship that is still, I fear, being obscured by a reliance on a small number of sources and an interest in a relatively restricted number of actors.

STUART M. MCMANUS, Chinese University of Hong Kong DOI 10.1215/00182168-10277760

Ilustrados y franciscanos: La iconografía de los indios amazónicos en el Perú del siglo XVIII. By NÚRIA SALA I VILA. Girona, Spain: Universitat de Girona, 2021. Photographs. Maps. Figures. Appendixes. Notes. Bibliography. Index. 259 pp. Paper, €28.00.

In this art history, Núria Sala i Vila explores the representation of otherness in the iconography of the people of the Peruvian Amazon during the eighteenth century. The author argues that what we see in most of these representations is actually a "double otherness" (doble alteridad)—which not only was the result of the gaze of an outsider but in most cases was generated by a third party without direct experience with the subjects they were depicting. This problem of studying Amazonian people through the lens of others is a well-known concern among scholars of the region; however, Sala i Vila demonstrates how images, as opposed to written texts, about the Amazon and its people were probably the most potent medium in disseminating knowledge during the eighteenth century. To accomplish this, the author examines both the observers, whether they be highland Andeans, Catalan missionaries, or scientific explorers, and the re-creation of their observation by others. In doing so, Sala i Vila reveals the flaws in popular conceptions of Amazonian peoples in the eighteenth century, many of which remain with us today.

The book opens with a discussion of highland Andeans' perceptions of Amazonian people. In many ways they shaped the Spanish colonizers' first impressions of Amazonia. The author explores depictions of Amazonian ethnic groups by well-known Andean chroniclers such as Felipe Guáman Poma de Ayala. She also explores representations on Andean *queros*, highly decorated cups used in ceremonies. In general, while highland Andeans did show Amazonian peoples with some accuracy, they tended to also portray them as savages, less civilized than their highland counterparts.

Chapter 2 is where the core analysis begins, with an examination of images of Amazonian peoples created by Catalan Franciscan missionaries during the eighteenth century. At first these images were reflections of already existing stereotypes, but as the century went on and the Franciscans had more contact with Amazonians, these images became more accurate, highlighting the dress and customs of the various ethnic groups that the missionaries encountered. These more accurate images, however, were by no means focused on Indigenous peoples. Instead, most were representations of the Franciscan martyrs who had died in service as missionaries to the Amazons. This meant that while some depictions were of peaceful converts, most were bellicose scenes of Franciscans being massacred—a rather skewed perception indeed. These types of images were reproduced as part of a campaign for increased government assistance in Franciscan missionary efforts, especially those carried out by Santa Rosa de Ocopa.

Chapters 3, 4, and 5 explore images produced during scientific expeditions in the eighteenth century. In most cases, these expeditions were at the behest of the Spanish government and focused primarily on the discoveries of commercially beneficial products that could be sold for profit. Therefore, while Amazonian peoples were depicted in these accounts, they were minor characters next to the flora and fauna. These expeditions include those carried out by Hipólito Ruiz for the Enlightenment-inspired periodical the *Mercurio Peruano* and Francisco Requena's survey of the Peruvian Amazon to determine Spain's newly negotiated border with Portugal.

The final chapters (chapters 6 and 7) demonstrate how texts and images created by firsthand missionary and scientific accounts of the Amazon later became the source material from which other authors drew to create widely disseminated images of the Amazon and its people. These secondhand accounts were the greatest culprits in exacerbating stereotypes about Amazonian peoples and perpetuating inaccurate descriptions of the region. In the case of the Franciscans (discussed in chapter 6), these images

Book Reviews / Eighteenth-Nineteenth Centuries

served as recruitment and fundraising tools aimed at further expanding their missionary effort. For the more scientific publications, the goal was to advance government investment in developing commerce in the Amazon. Either way, these are the images that became widely circulated and have affected the popular perception of Spanish Amazonia since their creation.

This book has much to be praised. Indeed, the collection of images alone, many of which have not been previously published, is an impressive feat. Particularly fascinating is appendix I, which has a guide to the ways in which each major ethnic group in Spanish Amazonia was portrayed in various publications throughout the eighteenth century. However, while the work does demonstrate in great detail how Amazonian people were portrayed, it does not give them any voice as to their portrayal. Furthermore, I would have liked to have seen some discussion of Jorge Cañizares-Esguerra's interpretation of the Enlightenment in Latin America. Nevertheless, the book is an essential text for understanding the historiography of the Spanish Amazon.

CAMERON JONES, California Polytechnic State University DOI 10.1215/00182168-10216746

Wage-Earning Slaves: Coartación in Nineteenth-Century Cuba

By CLAUDIA VARELLA and MANUEL BARCIA. Gainesville: University of Florida Press, 2020. Figures. Tables. Appendix. Notes. Bibliography. Index. xvi, 217 pp. Cloth, \$85.00.

One of the aims of this excellent book is to show how extremely complicated the agency of slaves was within the given legality of a specific slavery regime. The analysis shows a much more dynamic slavery in Cuba than in the United States or Brazil—namely, a capitalist commodification of slaves amid extreme asymmetrical colonial dependency, which also could hardly be controlled by a state-formed legality. Market economic relationships between slaves (*esclavos*) and masters (*amos*) were complicated and dynamic. In the course of the second slavery's development in Cuba during the nineteenth century, the state increasingly intervened in this "private relationship"—above all because the amos needed more money and became increasingly violent and fraudulent, "the most common abuse [being] not putting the [oral] *coartación* agreement in writing" (pp. 139, 6).

Chapter 1 explains both the law and practice of self-freeing in Cuban slavery and their role for (and effect on) the enslaved as well as their significance for the dynamics of Cuban slavery in the age of abolition (1800–1886) and for the formal end of slavery. Chapter 2 shows that the laws about *coartación* (self-ransom) in Cuba (and Puerto Rico) were first implemented for tax reasons (the state charged the *alcabala*—sales tax—for informal businesses in which slaves under coartación worked), then to regulate the "private negotiations" between amos and slaves (for which the office of slave lawyer—*síndico*—was created), and finally as a legal path for the Spanish state to attempt, although relatively late, to end slavery as such (p. 32).

Chapter 3 analyzes the conflicts that arose from formally recognizing the institution of coartación in 1842 and its use by slaves and the síndicos as municipal "protectors" of the